

Roderick McKelvie
October 26, 2017

1

1 UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
2 BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

3 -----X
4 ASKELADDEN LLC, :
5 : Case No:
6 Petitioner : IPR2017-00726
7 :
8 -vs- : Patent 8,285,648
9 : B2
10 VERIFY SMART CORP., :
11 : Pages 1 - 152
12 Patent Owner :
13 -----X

14 PROTECTIVE ORDER MATERIAL

15 Deposition of The Honorable Roderick R. McKelvie

16 Washington, D.C.

17 Thursday, October 26, 2017

18
19
20
21
22
23
24 Reported by: Kathleen M. Vaglica, RPR, RMR

25 Job No: 216940

Roderick McKelvie
October 26, 2017

2

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Thursday, October 26, 2017

(12:04 p.m.)

Deposition of The Honorable Roderick R. McKelvie,
held at the offices of:

Price Benowitz, LLP
409 7th Street, N.W.
Suite 200
Washington, D.C. 20004

Pursuant to notice, before Kathleen M. Vaglica, RPR,
RMR, a Notary Public in and for the District of
Columbia.

October 26, 2017

3

A P P E A R A N C E S

COUNSEL FOR PATENT OWNER, VERIFY SMART CORP.

STEVEN M. HOFFBERG, ESQUIRE

Tully Rinckey, PLLC

777 Third Avenue

22nd Floor

New York, NY 10017

(646) 201-9100

shoffberg@tullylegal.com

JEAN-MARC ZIMMERMAN, ESQUIRE

Zimmerman Law Group

226 St. Paul Street

Westfield, NJ 07090

(908) 654-8000

October 26, 2017

4

1 COUNSEL FOR PETITIONER, ASKELADDEN LLC

2 CHARLES R. MACEDO, ESQUIRE

3 MARK BERKOWITZ, ESQUIRE

4 Amster, Rothstein & Ebenstein, LLP

5 90 Park Avenue

6 New York, NY 10016

7 (212) 336-8000

8 cmacedo@arelaw.com

9 mberkowitz@arelaw.com

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 Q. And where does Askeladden receive its
2 funds from?

3 MR. MACEDO: Objection to form.

4 THE WITNESS: I don't know.

5 BY MR. HOFFBERG:

6 Q. Have you ever asked?

7 MR. MACEDO: Objection to form.

8 THE WITNESS: No. I've seen provisions in
9 the amended agreement that restrict certain members
10 of Clearing House from making contributions to
11 Askeladden for particular matters.

12 BY MR. HOFFBERG:

13 Q. That you say for particular matters.

14 A. Right.

15 Q. So what that means is that a, there are
16 certain persons who are prohibited from selectively
17 funding particular activities of the Patent
18 Challenge Committee?

19 A. Right. We want to avoid being in privy
20 with the member banks of The Clearing House, so the
21 guidelines and the amended agreement try to insulate
22 PCC from contact with or funding by members of The
23 Clearing House.

24 Q. Okay. Who are the members of The Clearing
25 House?

October 26, 2017

62

1 the committee.

2 Q. And how did this patent come to your
3 attention?

4 A. Jim forwarded it to me.

5 Q. So Jim Howard first suggested to you that
6 you should look at this patent, which I'll call the
7 '648 patent?

8 MR. MACEDO: Objection to form.

9 THE WITNESS: I don't know that he first
10 suggested it to me, but he first forwarded it to me.

11 BY MR. HOFFBERG:

12 Q. Well, who first called your attention to
13 the existence of this patent?

14 A. Jim Howard.

15 Q. Okay. And did any other member of the
16 committee have prior knowledge of this patent?

17 A. I don't know.

18 Q. But none of them had indicated to you that
19 this patent was of interest to them prior to Jim
20 Howard forwarding it to you?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. So would it be fair to say that the
23 interest in this patent came from Jim Howard?

24 MR. MACEDO: Objection to form.

25 THE WITNESS: It might have come from Jim

1 "The Patent Challenge Committee shall have sole
2 discretion to determine how to apply the foregoing
3 criteria and shall not be obligated to take into
4 account any factor in any case."

5 That's the middle of page 19 of 20 with
6 page number 13 also.

7 MR. MACEDO: Is there a question there?

8 MR. HOFFBERG: No.

9 THE WITNESS: What's the question?

10 BY MR. HOFFBERG:

11 Q. The question was I point your attention to
12 that paragraph.

13 A. I see it.

14 Q. How, how did you apply your discretion in
15 this case?

16 MR. MACEDO: To the extent that you are
17 not disclosing confidences provided by counsel, you
18 may answer, if you can.

19 THE WITNESS: We exercised our authority
20 consistent with this paragraph by confirming that
21 Verify Smart had pending litigation against Wells
22 Fargo, and we decided to proceed with the
23 investigation, but to defer decision on whether to
24 file so that we wouldn't contravene these directions
25 in these paragraphs.

October 26, 2017

72

1 the invention or licenses the invention. I don't
2 think it refers to race or gender. I think it
3 refers to status.

4 BY MR. HOFFBERG:

5 Q. Okay. And -- off the record for a minute.

6 (Discussion held off the record.)

7 BY MR. HOFFBERG:

8 Q. I'd like to refer back to page 10 of 20
9 with footer number 4 of Exhibit 1013, paragraph 11C.

10 A. All right.

11 MR. MACEDO: 11C in the agreement?

12 MR. HOFFBERG: It's 11C in the Amended LLC
13 Agreement.

14 THE WITNESS: All right.

15 BY MR. HOFFBERG:

16 Q. You indicated that Mr. Jim Howard
17 presented the '648 patent to you for your
18 consideration?

19 MR. MACEDO: Objection to form.

20 THE WITNESS: Yes.

21 BY MR. HOFFBERG:

22 Q. Okay. But 11C says -- I'll have to read
23 the whole thing. I'm sorry. "The Patent Challenge
24 Committee shall be solely responsible for carrying
25 out the purpose and shall operate independently of